

38

**From:** PSR(IC)3 (ISED)  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 11 October 2011 1:31 p.m.  
**To:** ...MFA P/S (Inet)  
**Cc:** ...DPMC FPA (Inet); PSR(IC)3 (DS MLG); PSR(IC)3 (ISED);  
PSR(IC)3 (ISED)  
**Subject:** UNAMA Report: follow up

MFA P/S, a couple of additional points on the UNAMA Report.

Regarding your question about whether the torture was "systematic", the following seems quite a helpful clarification:

UNAMA' findings to date are that NDS officials systematically tortured detainees in a number of detention facilities across Afghanistan. Torture does not appear to have been practiced systematically in each NDS facility UNAMA observed. In other facilities UNAMA observed, more investigation is required to determine whether torture is used systematically in the facility. UNAMA concludes on the basis of the findings of this observation programme that the use of torture is not a *de facto* institutional policy directed or ordered by the highest levels of NDS leadership or the Government. This together with the fact that NDS cooperated with UNAMA's detention observation programme suggests that reform is both possible and desired by elements within the NDS. (Extract from UNAMA Report (p11)).

Separately, note that there might be some question over the response of the Afghan Government. While there may be individuals who do not accept the findings, the following extract from the UNAMA media release on the report implies some level of UNAMA satisfaction with the GIROA response:

The Afghan authorities, following UNAMA's presentation of its early findings to them, launched their own investigations and initiated remedial action, which are reflected in their detailed response annexed to UNAMA's report. NDS and MoI have stated clearly they have an action plan to address these concerns, started investigations, reassigned personnel in the case of NDS, and have further indicated that responsible individuals will be suspended from their positions and in serious cases, prosecuted. (Extract from UNAMA Media Release 10 October)

Cheers

ISED